



SPT Subway Modernisation: Station Refurbishments - award of contracts

Date of meeting 28 September 2018

Date of report 6 September 2018

Report by Senior Director

1. Object of report

To recommend the Partnership approve the award of the Station's Refurbishment contract for Lot One (St George's Cross and Kinning Park) and Lot Two (Cowcaddens and West Street) to John Graham Construction Ltd.

2. Background

The Station Refurbishment works are part of the Subway Modernisation Programme which has successfully delivered 11 out of the 15 stations. The previous stations to be refurbished were Shields Road and Bridge Street, which were both completed in the first half of 2018.

The final four stations to be delivered have been divided between two Lots. This will see the successful conclusion of the Stations Refurbishment work stream which is a significant milestone in the Modernisation Programme.

3. Outline of proposals

3.1 Scope of works

The works at these four stations will follow the same high quality approach used at the previous stations to provide a clean, efficient and modern passenger friendly environment. The scope includes the replacement of materials to floors, walls and ceilings throughout the station. Wayfinding, information and general signage for passengers will be improved by rationalising signage in line with current branding, upgrading of passenger facilities and equipment, with more efficient LED lighting and a wide range of enhancements under the Equalities Act will be included.

Mechanical and electrical elements will also be upgraded during the works which will include a new station master's panel, fire detection system, emergency lighting, ventilation, heating and air-conditioning.

The station layouts for all four stations will generally remain the same, however new rooms will be formed on the concourses at West St and St George's Cross to house future rolling stock equipment. Small areas within Cowcaddens and Kinning Park are being repurposed to house new electrical equipment. Cowcaddens will have a new

high level glazed roof installed, this will allow natural light into the station and enhance the appearance of the station externally.

3.2 Tender assessment process

The station tenders were issued as lots via Public Contracts Scotland (PCS) and this was a two stage tender. Stage One required the completion of the European Single Procurement Document (ESPD) which facilitates the shortlisting of candidates being invited to submit a tender (Stage Two).

Amalgamated Construction Ltd	Clark Contracts Ltd	CBC (Glasgow) Ltd	Geo-Structural Ltd	John Graham Construction Ltd
------------------------------	---------------------	-------------------	--------------------	------------------------------

Five contractors noted in the table above submitted responses to the ESPD, however Geo-Structural were not invited to progress with the tender as the company did not meet the qualification requirements.

Of the four contractors invited to the second stage, Amalgamated Construction Ltd and CBC (Glasgow) Ltd both withdrew during the tendering process.

Compliant bids were submitted on 6 August 2018 by John Graham Construction Ltd and Clarks Contracts Ltd.

The tenders were assessed on the basis of a 60:40 Quality:Cost split, with the quality criteria of 'Methodology', 'Management', 'Quality' and 'Safety'.

The tenders were assessed by four members of SPT Projects team with an overview by Subway Operations, this was supported by a separate review of costs by an independent cost consultant (Currie & Brown). The quality assessment scores and the cost results are summarised in the tables within section 3.3 below.

3.3 Tender assessment results

Lot One: St Georges Cross and Kinning Park					
Tenderers	Tender Price	Weighted Quality Score (out of 60)	Weighted Cost Score (out of 40)	Overall Score	Ranking
John Graham Construction Ltd	£3,097,366.80	60	40	100	1
Clark Contracts Ltd	£4,051,891.71	36	31	67	2

Lot Two: Cowcaddens and West Street					
Tenderers	Tender Price	Weighted Quality Score (out of 60)	Weighted Cost Score (out of 40)	Overall Score	Ranking
John Graham Construction Ltd	£3,449,651.70	60	40	100	1
Clark Contracts Ltd	£4,390,849.49	38	31	69	2

Based on the combined quality and commercial evaluation and following clarifications, John Graham Construction Ltd.'s submission is the most economically advantageous tender submission for each Lot.

The quality submission by John Graham Construction Ltd scored highest in the management, methodology and safety sections.

The methodology section included details of program, phasing of works and details of how subway operations would be maintained. The programmes for all four stations were well presented and offered the most realistic timescales, they were both logical and well thought through. Their proposals for the temporary ticket office and phasing of works throughout each station were conveyed equally by detailed illustrations and comprehensive text.

3.4 Outline programme

Pending approval to award, works to the first two stations is scheduled to commence in Autumn 2018. No more than two stations are to be under refurbishment at the same time to reduce pressure on operations and staffing resources. Construction programmes will need to be agreed with John Graham Construction Ltd however these are likely to be based closely on the tender programmes with all stations complete by 2020.

4. Conclusion

The tender assessment for Lot One: St George's Cross and Kinning Park and Lot Two: Cowcaddens and West Street shows that John Graham Construction Ltd has submitted the most economically advantageous tenders, therefore taking into account both quality and cost as outlined in the tendering criteria, they are recommended to be the preferred bidder for both Lots.

5. Partnership action

The Partnership is recommended to approve:

- award of contract for Lot One: St George's Cross and Kinning Park to John Graham Construction Ltd up to £3,097,366.80 excluding VAT; and
- award of contract for Lot Two: Cowcaddens and West Street to John Graham Construction Ltd up to £3,449,651.70 excluding VAT.

6. Consequences

Policy consequences	<i>This is part of subway modernisation which meets the strategic priority of 'Revitalising the Subway Network'.</i>
Legal consequences	<i>Contract Notice is required to be posted in OJEU and the award is subject to the statutory standstill period. Contract with John Graham Construction Ltd will require to be formally executed.</i>
Financial consequences	<i>The tendered sum is proposed to be accommodated within the 2018/19 and 2019/20 Capital Programme Category 1 Project 10022 Station Improvements.</i>
Personnel consequences	<i>Existing internal project management resources to be used.</i>

Equalities consequences

Works include improved access for all.

Risk consequences

Risks have been mitigated through lessons learned from previous station refurbishment projects, most notably the undertaking of additional survey works prior to the main works commencing. Residual risks will be managed by SPT and if required any unforeseen conditions will utilise the station improvements contingency.

Name Charles Hoskins
Title Senior Director

Name Gordon MacLennan
Title Chief Executive

For further information, please contact *David Gardner, Senior Project Manager on 0141 333 3132.*